

# A POLISH GROUP CONTAINING A HAAR NULL $F_\sigma$ -SUBGROUP THAT CANNOT BE ENLARGED TO A HAAR NULL $G_\delta$ -SET

TARAS BANAKH

ABSTRACT. Answering a question of Elekes and Vidnyánszky, we construct a Polish meta-abelian group  $H$  and a subgroup  $F \subset H$ , which is a Haar null  $F_\sigma$ -set in  $H$  that cannot be enlarged to a Haar null  $G_\delta$ -set.

A Borel subset  $B$  of a Polish group  $H$  is called *Haar null* if there exists a  $\sigma$ -additive Borel probability measure  $\mu$  on  $H$  such that  $\mu(xBy) = 0$ . It is well-known [1] that a Borel subset of a Polish locally compact group  $H$  is Haar null if and only if  $B$  has Haar measure zero if and only if  $B$  is contained in a Haar null  $G_\delta$ -subset of  $H$ . As was shown by Elekes and Vidnyánszky [2], for non-locally compact Polish groups the latter result is not true: each non-locally compact Polish abelian group  $H$  contains a Borel Haar null subset  $B \subset H$  which is not contained in a Haar null  $G_\delta$ -set in  $H$ . However, the construction of the Borel set  $B$  exploited in [2] does not allow to evaluate the Borel complexity of  $B$ . Because of that, Elekes and Vidnyánszky asked in [2] whether each Haar null  $F_\sigma$ -subset  $B$  of a Polish (Abelian) group  $H$  can be enlarged to a Haar null  $G_\delta$ -set. In this section we partly answer this problem presenting an example of a Polish meta-Abelian group  $H$  and a Haar null  $F_\sigma$ -subgroup  $F \subset H$  that cannot be enlarged to a Haar null  $G_\delta$ -set.

A topological group  $H$  is *meta-abelian* if  $H$  contains a closed normal abelian subgroup  $A \subset H$  such that the quotient group  $H/A$  is Abelian.

We define a subset  $B$  of topological group  $H$  to be *thick* if for every compact subset  $K \subset H$  there are points  $x, y \in H$  such that  $xKy \subset B$ . It is easy to see that a thick Borel subset of Polish groups cannot be Haar null.

**Theorem 1.** *There exists a Polish meta-abelian group  $H$  containing a subgroup  $F \subset H$  such that  $F$  is a Haar null  $F_\sigma$ -set in  $H$  but every  $G_\delta$ -set  $G \subset H$  containing  $B$  is thick and hence is not Haar null in  $H$ .*

*Proof.* Observe that the countable power  $R = \mathbb{R}^\omega$  of the real lines has the structure of a unital topological ring and the dense  $G_\delta$ -set  $(\mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\})^\omega$  coincides with the set  $R^*$  of invertible elements of the ring  $R$ . On the product  $H = R \times R^*$  consider the binary operation  $\star : H \times H \rightarrow H$  defined by the formula

$$(x, a) \star (y, b) = (x + ay, ab) \quad \text{for } (x, a), (y, b) \in H = R \times R^*.$$

The Polish space  $H = R \times R^*$  endowed with this binary operation is a Polish group called the *semidirect product* of  $R$  and  $R^*$ .

In the topological ring  $R = \mathbb{R}^\omega$  consider the  $F_\sigma$ -subset

$$R_0 = \{(x_n)_{n \in \omega} \in \mathbb{R}^\omega : \exists n \in \omega \forall m \geq n \ x_m = 0\}$$

consisting of all eventually zero sequences. It follows that  $R_0$  is a subring of  $R$  and  $F = R_0 \times R^* \subset H$  is a subgroup of the Polish group  $H$ . We claim that the subgroup  $F$  has the desired properties.

**Lemma 1.** *The subset  $F$  is Haar null in  $H$ .*

*Proof.* Taking into account that  $R_0$  is a Borel non-open subgroup of the Polish Abelian group  $R$ , we can apply a classical result of Christensen [1] and conclude that  $R_0$  is Haar null in  $R$ . This allows us to find a probability measure  $\mu$  on  $R$  such that  $\mu(x + R_0) = 0$  for all  $x \in R$ . Identifying  $R$  with the normal subgroup  $R \times \{1\}$  of  $H$ , we can consider the measure  $\mu$  as a measure on  $H$ . Then for every elements  $(x, a), (y, b) \in H$  we get

$$((x, a) \star F \star (y, b)) \cap (R \times \{1\}) = (x, a) \star (R_0 \times \{a^{-1}b^{-1}\}) \star (y, b) = (x + a \cdot R_0 + a^{-1}b^{-1}y, 1)$$

and hence

$$\mu((x, a) \star F \star (y, b)) = \mu(x + a \cdot R_0 + a^{-1}b^{-1}y) = \mu(x + a^{-1}b^{-1}y + R_0) = 0$$

by the choice of  $\mu$ . So, the measure  $\mu$  witnesses that the set  $F = R_0 \times R^*$  is Haar null in  $H$ . □

---

1991 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* 22A10; 28C10.

**Lemma 2.** *Every  $G_\delta$ -set  $G \subset H$  containing  $F$  is thick.*

*Proof.* Given a  $G_\delta$ -set  $G \subset H$  containing  $F$ , consider its complement  $H \setminus G$  and write it as a countable union  $H \setminus G = \bigcup_{k \in \omega} E_k$  of an increasing sequence  $(E_k)_{k \in \omega}$  of closed sets in  $H$ . To prove that  $G$  is thick in  $H$ , it suffices for every compact subset  $K \subset H$  to find an element  $h \in H$  such that  $hKh^{-1} \subset G$ . Given a compact set  $K \subset H$  choose compact sets  $C \subset R$  and  $C^* \subset R^*$  such that  $K \subset C \times C^*$ . Observe that for every element  $a \in R^*$  and the element  $h = (0, a) \in H$  we get  $h^{-1} = (0, a^{-1})$  and hence

$$hKh^{-1} \subset (0, a) \star (C \times C^*) \star (0, a^{-1}) \subset aC \times C^*.$$

Now it suffices to find an element  $a \in R^*$  such that  $(aC \times C^*) \cap E_k = \emptyset$  for all  $k \in \omega$ . The compactness of the set  $C^*$  guarantees that the projection  $\text{pr} : R \times C^* \rightarrow R$ ,  $\text{pr} : (x, y) \mapsto x$ , is closed and for every  $k \in \omega$  the set  $P_k = \text{pr}(E_k \cap (R \times C^*))$  is closed in  $R$  and does not intersect the  $F_\sigma$ -subgroup  $R_0$ . Observe that the set  $R_k^* = \{a \in R^* : aC \cap P_k = \emptyset\}$  is contained in  $\{a \in R^* : (aC \times C^*) \cap E_n \neq \emptyset\}$ . The compactness of the set  $C$  implies that the set  $R_n^*$  is open in  $R^*$ .

**Claim 1.** *For every  $k \in \omega$  the set  $R_k^*$  is dense in  $R^*$ .*

*Proof.* Given any element  $a = (a_n)_{n \in \omega} \in R = \mathbb{R}^\omega$  and any neighborhood  $O_a \subset R$ , find  $m \in \omega$  such that the closed subspace  $\{(b_n)_{n \in \omega} \in \mathbb{R}^\omega : \forall n < m \ b_n = a_n\}$  is contained in  $O_a$ . Find a sequence  $(C_n)_{n \in \omega}$  of compact subsets of the real line such that  $C \subset \prod_{n \in \omega} C_n$ . Consider the compact space  $\Pi = \prod_{n < k} a_n C_n$  and observe that the projection  $\pi : \Pi \times \mathbb{R}^{\omega \setminus k} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^{\omega \setminus k}$ ,  $\pi : (x, y) \mapsto y$ , is a closed map. This implies that the set  $\tilde{P}_k = \pi_k((\Pi \times \mathbb{R}^{\omega \setminus k}) \cap P_k)$  is closed in  $\mathbb{R}^{\omega \setminus k}$  and does not contain the constant zero function  $z \in \mathbb{R}^{\omega \setminus k}$ . By the compactness of the product  $C_{\geq k} = \prod_{n \geq k} C_n \subset \mathbb{R}^{\omega \setminus k}$  and the continuity of multiplication in the topological ring  $\mathbb{R}^{\omega \setminus k}$ , there exists an element  $\varepsilon \in (\mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\})^{\omega \setminus k}$  so close to zero that  $(\varepsilon \cdot C_{\geq k}) \cap \tilde{P}_k = \emptyset$ . Then for the element  $b = (b_n)_{n \in \omega} \in O_a$  defined by  $b_n = a_n$  for  $n < k$  and  $b_n = \varepsilon_n$  for  $n \geq k$  we get

$$(b \cdot C) \cap P_n \subset \left( \prod_{n \in \omega} b_n C_n \right) \cap P_n \subset \left( \prod_{n < k} a_n C_n \right) \times \left( \left( \prod_{n \geq k} \varepsilon_n C_n \right) \cap \tilde{P}_k \right) = \emptyset$$

and hence  $b \in O_a \cap R_k^*$ . □

Claim 1 combined with the Baire Theorem guarantees that  $\bigcap_{k \in \omega} R_k^*$  is a dense  $G_\delta$ -set in the Polish space  $R^*$ . Then we can take any point  $a \in \bigcap_{k \in \omega} R_k^*$  and conclude that  $(aC \times C^*) \cap \bigcup_{k \in \omega} E_k = \emptyset$  and hence for the element  $h = (0, a)$  we get  $hKh^{-1} \subset G$ . □

□

However, Theorem 1 gives no answer to the following two problems posed by Elekes and Vidnyánszky in [2].

**Problem 1.** *Is each Haar null  $F_\sigma$ -subset of an uncountable Polish Abelian group  $G$  contained in a Haar null  $G_\delta$ -subset of  $G$ ?*

**Problem 2.** *Is each countable subset of an uncountable Polish group  $G$  contained in a Haar null  $G_\delta$ -subset of  $G$ ?*

By Remark 5.3 [2] the answer to Problem 2 is affirmative for Polish abelian groups.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] J. Christensen, *On sets of Haar measure zero in abelian Polish groups*, Israel J. Math. 13 (1972), 255–260 (1973).  
 [2] M. Elekes, Z. Vidnyánszky, *Haar null sets without  $G_\delta$ -hulls*, Israel J. Math. 209 (2015) 199–214.

IVAN FRANKO NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF LVIV (UKRAINE) AND JAN KOCHANOWSKI UNIVERSITY IN KIELCE (POLAND)  
*E-mail address:* t.o.banakh@gmail.com